

Edward A. Chow, M.D.
President

David B. Singer
Vice President

Cecilia Chung
Commissioner

Judith Karshmer, Ph.D., PMHCNS-BC.
Commissioner

David Pating, M.D
Commissioner

David J. Sanchez, Jr., Ph.D.
Commissioner

Belle Taylor-McGhee
Commissioner

**HEALTH COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN
FRANCISCO**

Edwin M. Lee, Mayor
Department of Public Health



Barbara A. Garcia, M.P.A.
Director of Health

Mark Morewitz, M.S.W.
Executive Secretary

TEL (415) 554-2666

FAX (415) 554-2665

Web Site: <http://www.sfdph.org>

MINUTES

HEALTH COMMISSION MEETING

Tuesday, October 6, 2015, 2:00 p.m.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Room 330A

San Francisco, CA 94102

1) CALL TO ORDER

Present: Commissioner Edward A. Chow M.D., President
Commissioner David B. Singer, Vice President (left 6pm)
Commissioner Cecilia Chung
Commissioner Judith Karshmer, Ph.D, PMHCNS-BC
Commissioner David Pating, M.D.
Commissioner David J. Sanchez Jr., Ph.D.
Commissioner Belle Taylor-McGhee

The meeting was called to order at 2:11pm.

2) APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE HEALTH COMMISSION MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 15, 2015

Action Taken: The Health Commission unanimously approved the minutes.

3) GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Clean Air Health Alliance, stated that the community participation process has not been effective for the Candlestick Park project; the community was engaged from February through April of 2015 but since then there has been no communication until receiving the final dust-related recommendations through an email. He also stated that the Alliance and the community are opposed to the recommendations in the plan and ask that the Health Commission act so the recommendations are rejected. He added that the Alliance set up their own monitoring of the dust and air and has different data than what was used by the DPH.

Yolanda Lewis, Black Human Rights Coalition, stated that she and the Coalition are against the recommendations contained in the final report and asked that the Department of Public Health to treat the community fairly.

Dr. Espanola Jackson, resident of San Francisco for 72 years, stated that there is a long history of the DPH not treating the Bayview community fairly in regard to safety issues involving the shipyard.

Ruth Sakheim, Beth Sholom teach and San Francisco resident, stated that she is deeply concerned for the residents of the Bayview due to the socio-economic and pollution issues. She reminded the Health Commission that the DPH mission statement says that it works towards the health of all San Franciscans. She added that the construction in the Bayview is causing dust to blow all over the neighborhood.

Shirley Moore, Clean Air Health Alliance, stated that she lives in Candlestick Point near the stadium and is concerned about the level of dust. She noted that plumes of dust come from the stadium and spread all over the area; residue from trucks also impacts the neighborhood. She requested that the DPH work to force the developer to dampen the dust in all of the construction sites.

Monisha Mustapha stated that the community has identified the following changes that should be made to the dust control plan: future dust control plans should be based on topography of the microclimate; placement of weather station monitors be placed in surrounding neighborhoods at various elevations; all construction work should stop when wind gets to be force 4 (12-18 mph); and a requirement that a DPH staff member will provide evaluation of all third party reports.

Julia Barber, Bayview Hill Neighborhood Association, stated that she lives next to the stadium. She noted that the new dust control plan had no input from the Association or the community. She noted that the wind in that area does not blow in one direction and the dust from the construction site travels throughout the neighborhood and impacts the health of the residents.

Ebony Isler, resident of the Bayview and lives next door to Candlestick Park, stated that the construction has made her allergy symptoms worsen. She also stated that African Americans are fighting to stay in San Francisco and to stay healthy. She requested that the DPH have more compassion and sympathy for the community to involve the residents in decisions that impact them.

Anne Donjacour, San Francisco resident and adjunct professor at UCSF, stated that she supports the recommendations of the Clean Air Alliance. She pointed out that some residents of the Bayview have almost died due to the dust from the construction site.

Eric Brooks, coordinator of Our City SF and a member of the Green party, stated that he sees the SFDPH having deference to existing state and federal standards that are not acceptable. He requested that the SFDPH adopt appropriate air and dust standards for the Bayview neighborhood.

Dante Coao stated that he grew up in Bayview Hunters. He and a friend have continued to get sick from the construction site dust. He asked the Health Commission to consider the impact of the dust on the community and to remember that the issue of affordable housing is important too.

Maria Harrison, resident of the Bayview and a member of Greenaction, stated that her community is suffering, dying, or moving away from San Francisco. She noted that the SFDPH representative assigned to this project does not have the correct information to explain why construction permits were approved. She noted that the dust standards were developed for white men who are 35 years old and 6'1 tall.

Ollie Burgess, Chair of Southeast Health Center Advisory Board, stated that the Advisory Board supports the Clean Air Health Alliance recommendations. She noted that the SFDPH staff members who previously worked with the community are no longer employed by the SFDPH; she requested assistance increasing the outreach to the Bayview.

Perry Lang, Executive Director, Rafiki Health and Wellness and the African American Health Equity Council. He stated that the Council supports the recommendations put forth by the Clean Air Health Alliance. He also shared information regarding the Rafiki Passport program.

Commissioner Chow thanked all those who made public comment and asked Director Garcia to report back to the Health Commission through its Community and Public Health Committee on this issue. Director Garcia stated she will ensure that the DPH works with the Bayview community to find suitable solutions to the situation; she also stated that she will work with her staff to attempt to move forward with the Alliance recommendations that seem feasible.

4) SFDPH PUBLIC HEALTH ROLES, MANDATES, AND BUDGETING

Barbara Garcia, Director of Health and Colleen Chawla, Deputy Director of Health and Director of Policy and Planning, Greg Wagner, Chief Financial Officer, presented.

Commissioner Comments/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked if any of the public health mandated activities will have an end date. Ms. Chawla stated that there are frequent changes to the mandated activities and some do end.

Commissioner Chow asked for more information on General Fund and state Realignment funding for the Population Health Division (PHD). Greg Wagner, SFDPH CFO, stated that state Realignment funds in the DPH budget are located in the Central Administration. He noted that state Realignment began to reclaim funds from counties in fiscal year 2013-2014 but San Francisco did not have to return funds to the state. However, in fiscal year 14-15, it is expected that the DPH will need to return \$32.7M to the state; 42% of these funds will come from PHD and 58% of the funds will derive from the San Francisco Health Network (SFHN).

Commissioner Singer stated that the Health Commission needs to better understand the decision-making process regarding how to determine the level of service for unfunded mandates. Commissioner Pating noted that mandates and funding often do not match local needs. Director Garcia stated funding decisions begin with considering the priorities from the previous budget cycle; she utilizes staff expertise to develop plans to address appropriate priorities for San Francisco. She noted that the implementation of the Affordable Care Act forced a shift in priorities. She also stated that the public health accreditation process has been a helpful paradigm to structure PHD budget decisions. She added that data and community needs also factor in to how budget decisions are made each year.

Commissioner Karshmer stated that often presentations to the Health Commission focus on successes. She encouraged the DPH to utilize the Health Commission when complex discussions about program changes or closures are necessary. Director Garcia stated that the DPH strives to always measure program efficiencies and effectiveness but evaluation is often not funded.

Commissioner Chow commented Dr. Aragon for the creation and ongoing management of PHD and noted that under this organization structure, he can manage a more unified Division.

5) DEMOGRAPHIC DATA FOR SAN FRANCISCO

Colleen Chawla, Deputy Director of Health and Director of Policy and Planning, reviewed the data.

Commissioner Singer noted that San Francisco is changing rapidly and that the 2010 Census data is likely not an accurate representation of the City in late 2015. He asked how the SFDPH plans to use more accurate data to plan for the future. Ms. Chawla stated that the SFDPH utilizes existing data, reviews projections, utilizes its own extensive program data, and uses community input when planning for future projects.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked if there are associated health indicators related to the data showing that the numbers of African Americans are declining in San Francisco. She noted that the African American community feels the decline is due to deaths related to health disparities and a number of people are moving

due to economic disparities. Dr. Aragon stated that those African Americans who are moving away from San Francisco likely have more financial resources than those who stay.

Commissioner Sanchez thanked Director Garcia and Dr. Aragon for the session. He noted a recent San Francisco Chronicle article discussing African American income disparities in San Francisco.

Commissioner Chung noted that there will be a shift in how the federal and state government will be funding HIV services; they will not be counting incidents instead of diagnoses which may impact the amount of funds San Francisco receives.

6) OVERVIEW OF THE POPULATION HEALTH DIVISION (PHD)

Tomás Aragón MD, Health Officer and Director of the Population Health Division, gave the presentation.

Commissioner Comments/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Pating noted that funding for central administration of the Division is important. Dr. Aragon stated that the General Fund is the most discretionary source of funding; the majority of funding is categorical.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked Dr. Aragon to note one positive outcome of the integration of services. Dr. Aragon stated that the Division's collective impact projects are an outcome of the integration and have the potential to deeply impact the community. He gave the examples of "Getting to Zero," which strives to have no new HIV infections, HIV-related deaths, and HIV stigma; and "Vision Zero," which strives to have zero pedestrian deaths.

Commissioner Pating asked whether the Community and Public Health Committee is the appropriate place for the Health Commission to discuss all of PHD related programs and information. Commissioner Chow stated that the Community and Public Health Committee is the most appropriate place for the Health Commission to discuss PHD-related programmatic issues and data. He noted that the Finance and Planning Committee will continue to review and discuss contract and fiscal-related matters, including those of PHD.

7) OVERVIEW OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH BRANCH

Tomás Aragón MD, Health Officer and Director of the Population Health Division, gave the presentation.

Commissioner Comment/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Singer asked for clarification of the "Operational" budget for this Branch; he noted that presentation materials show \$4.9M plus operational expenses. Richard Lee, Acting Director, stated that the \$4.9M only covers salaries and all other expenses associated with branch activities are considered the "Operational" budget.

Commissioner Singer asked if \$500,000 could be taken from one program to another, to which program would Dr. Aragon choose to add the funds. Dr. Aragon stated that he would add funds to collective impact projects because they have potential to affect the entire community.

8) OVERVIEW OF EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES (EMS)

Tomás Aragón MD, Health Officer and Director of the Population Health Division, gave the presentation.

Commissioner Comments/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Singer asked for more information on the assistance DPH provided to northern counties during the fires. Director Garcia stated that DPH sent eleven mental health providers, several with Spanish language skills to assist farm workers.

Commissioner Chow stated that the San Francisco emergency services are managed by three city departments: DPH, Department of Emergency Management (DEM), and the Fire Department. He asked how the SFDPH oversees its piece and coordinates with the other city departments. John Brown, Medical Director of Emergency Medical Services, stated that he works with DEM through a city work-order; he is responsible for giving direction on medical components and protocols of emergency planning and management. He noted that operation-related decisions are made by DEM management.

Commissioner Pating asked how San Francisco is preparing for the Super Bowl in January 2016. Dr. Brown stated that the City will be using an Incident Action Plan managed by DEM for the event. He noted that the City is working with most departments to plan for the event.

Commissioner Singer asked how most counties organize and manage their emergency services. Dr. Brown stated that most in most counties in California, the Department of Public Health manages the emergency medical services component. Commissioner Chow noted that historically the San Francisco DPH managed the emergency services including ambulances and paramedics.

9) OVERVIEW OF THE BLACK AFRICAN AMERICAN HEALTH INITIATIVE (BAAHI)

Jacque McCright, Deputy Director of the Office of Equity and Quality Improvement, Israel Nieves, Director of the Office of Equity and Quality Improvement, and Tracey Packer, Director of Community Health Equity and Promotion, gave the update on this item.

Commissioner Comments/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Taylor McGhee asked if the DPH is working with Rafiki Wellness on its Healthy Hearts grant. Dr. McCright stated that the DPH lists Rafiki Wellness on its Healthy Hearts grant resource list.

Commissioner Singer stated that lack of availability of fresh food is a key issue to consider. He noted that he is on the board of directors of College Track, an organization that helps prepare students for college. The organization is located in the Bayview and many of the students arrive after school having eating nothing all day. Dr. McCright stated that stated that Eat Us Up is a new program that distributes food vouchers for fresh fruit and vegetables. Commissioner Singer stated that without stores with fresh produce and vegetables in the neighborhood, residents of the Bayview have to go elsewhere to use the vouchers. Mr. Nieves stated that the Food Security Taskforce is working on the issue of food availability in the neighborhood. Commissioner Singer encouraged the DPH to utilize radical and innovative approaches in this economic and political climate. Commissioner Karshmer encouraged the DPH to explore providing food as part of its work in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Pating suggested that a short-term indicator be set for BAAHI. He noted that the collective impact projects leverage small amount of funds with high impact for a community.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked if BAAHI has data showing any positive changes for hypertension. Dr. McCright stated that San Francisco Health Network data shows improvement in high blood pressure for the Maxine Hall patients.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked if BAAHI is also striving to address obesity in the Latino population. Dr. McCright stated that BAAHI is working to also address obesity in the San Francisco Latino population.

Commissioner Singer noted that the income disparity is increasing in San Francisco. He observed that the Bayview community provided public comment at the meeting indicating that the process to develop the dust-standard report for Candle Stick Park did not include their input. He encouraged the City to have ambitious goals to effectively assist the Bayview community.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee stated that the DPH can only address issues within its jurisdiction.

Commissioner Karshmer congratulated the DPH on creating an infrastructure for BAAHI to make impactful change.

Commissioner Pating stated that making incremental impacts on African Americans' lives can help the community while realizing savings on health-related costs.

Commissioner Chung stated that social determinants and income equality are serious issues that impact the health of the African American community. She suggested having a "One-Stop" type of service center to assist the community with its needs. Director Garcia stated that HOPESF and Project 500 are examples of programs within the City that are working to assist African Americans out of poverty.

Commissioner Chow stated that having BAACHI within the PHD organizational framework seems to be more systematic and integrated.

10) PUBLIC HEALTH ACCREDITATION UPDATE

Israel Nieves, Director of the Office of Equity and Quality Improvement, gave the update.

Commissioner Comments/Follow-Up:

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee asked for clarity on the timeline to submit the DPH public health accreditation application. Mr. Nieves stated that the DPH hopes to submit its application in November 2015.

Commissioner Pating asked if the Community Benefits information is included in the Community Health Improvement Plan (CHIP). Ms. Chawla stated that the Community Benefits information is included in the CHIP.

Commissioner Karshmer asked for clarification on the length of time the accreditation will be valid. Mr. Nieves stated that the initial accreditation will be valid for five years.

Commissioners Karshmer asked if the DPH public health accreditation will involve the San Francisco Health Network (SFHN). Mr. Nieves stated that the accreditation is only for the Public Health Division; however, the accreditation may assist the SFDPH to be rewarded future grants that could assist both PHD and SFHN.

Director Garcia acknowledged the leadership of Dr. Aragon and the PHD team. She noted that strengthening the Division's infrastructure is important. She also stated that a future goal is to explore billing for STD and TB clinic services.

Commissioner Pating, Community and Public Health Committee Chair, requested the following schedule for Committee topics:

- Public Health Accreditation-every six months
- Branch Updates-annually
- Intermediate updates on large policy/plans (e.g. Children's Oral Health Strategic Plan)

He also requested that PHD continue to present with SFHN to indicate how each DPH Division works on various topics.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee requested that more quality data and individual stories be shared as part of these Community and Public Health Committee presentations.

11) OTHER BUSINESS:

This item was not discussed.

12) COMMITTEE AGENDA SETTING

This item was not discussed.

13) ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:11pm